

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	3
2. Trends.....	4
3. Drivers in the VET field.....	8
4. Scenario proposal	11
5. Critical issues discussed	13
6. Commented areas for improvement	13
7. Final scenario proposal.....	15

1. Introduction

The INVOLVE project aims to analyse the degree of social partner integration and participation in the governance of dual VET systems in four European countries: Spain, Greece, Poland and Portugal. These are countries that have recently developed projects of dual systems of VET or are attempting to strengthen, reinforce or improve dual VET systems. In order to achieve this objective, the research team carried out: a documentary analysis of the specialised literature and the most relevant regulations for dual VET and fieldwork based on semi-structured interviews with social partners and political managers.

Secondly, the project aims to develop scenarios on how to establish integrative governance structures of dual VET systems. This eminently normative objective is based on the premise that the participation of social partners in the design and implementation of VET is a value in itself, an essential element of good democratic governance, and a key element of the European Social Model. Likewise, the promotion of participation is based on the evidence that this is a fundamental instrument for improving the quality of a policy that requires, for its correct functioning, the participation, coordination and consensus of the social partners at different levels.

This second objective is approached on the basis of a deliberative scenario methodology, inspired by Cedefop's proposal¹. The objective of the deliberative scenario methodology is to develop consensual visions among social partners for more integrative governance structures. This methodology is developed on the basis of a workshop in which a small number of researchers and representatives of the most representative trade unions and employer organizations exchange ideas and try to reach consensus. As a preliminary step, the research team should identify the main trends and drivers, and formulate a first proposal of scenarios that constitute the starting point to the discussion. These scenarios are considered provisional and can, in fact, be replaced by new proposals resulting from the collective discussion. The elaboration of this first proposal of scenarios is based on the documentary analysis and the information obtained during the fieldwork, based on semi-structured interviews with social partners and political managers.

On this basis, the scenario proposal was discussed at the workshop on 15 December with the social partners who were interviewed. First, notus-asr presented the working document in which the main trends, the drivers of change and the two initial scenario proposals were outlined. Secondly, there were two rounds of interventions from the participants where they assessed the trends, drivers of change and critical aspects of the current governance model of VET and dual VET. Subsequently, in a second round of interventions, they assessed the two proposed scenarios, proposing possible improvements to be introduced. All of this is summarised in this report and results in the final proposal of 2 possible scenarios that seek increased participation of social partners in the governance of dual VET in Spain.

¹ Leney, T., Coles, M., Grollman, P. & Vilu, R. (2004): Scenarios toolkit. Cedefop dossier series: 8

2. Trends

In line with Cedefop's methodological proposal², an analysis has been made of some of the main trends detected in different areas that may have an impact on VET system in Spain.

- **Demography and social change**

- Population ageing

According to data from the National Institute of Statistics (INE), the ageing index in Spain is 125.79%, which means that there are 125 people over 64 years of age for every 100 people under 16 years of age. This rate has been rising steadily in recent years, standing at 106.5% in 2001. The ageing of the population generates discussions about the extension of working life and, consequently, on training policies to update the skills of workers.

- An increasingly urban population and rural depopulation

According to the General Diagnosis of the Demographic Challenge³, during the 21st century, 5,120 municipalities have lost population (63% of the total), of which 4,000 have less than 1,000 inhabitants (80% of the total). Therefore, depopulation affects more small municipalities and less populated areas (rural areas). It should also be borne in mind that in 2018, 80% of the Spanish population lived in cities, according to the World Bank, and that by 2050 it will be 88%, according to projections by the United Nations Population Division (UN). The gap between the rural and urban population is thus expected to continue to widen gradually over the coming decades in Spain. In this scenario, VET should form part of the set of policies aimed at reducing territorial inequalities and limiting depopulation trends.

- Insufficient reduction of gender inequalities in the labour market

According to the INE, in 2018, the most frequent annual salary for women was 15,484.40€, while the annual salary for men was 18,470.80€. This difference of 2,986.40€ per year represents a gender pay gap of 16.2%. According to data from the Labour Force Survey (EPA) for the third quarter of 2021, analysed by the Observatory of Equality and Employment of the Women's Foundation⁴, the activity rate of women was 54.23%, while the activity rate of men was 64.31%. This implies that the gender gap between women and men in the activity rate is 10.08%. Unemployment data for the same quarter show that the female unemployment rate was 16.36%, while the male unemployment rate was 12.97%. For this reason, the gender gap between women and men stands at 3.39%. Despite the fact that gender inequality responds to a plurality of factors, European institutions have emphasised in recent years the importance of increasing the

² Leney, T., Coles, M., Grollman, P. & Vilu, R. (2004): Scenarios toolkit. Cedefop dossier series: 8

³ MPTFP (2019): Directrices Generales de la Estrategia Nacional Frente el Reto Demográfico. Comisionado del Gobierno Frente al Reto Demográfico.

⁴ Observatorio Igualdad y Empleo (2021): Brechas de género: Tasa de paro y Tasa de actividad. Hoja Informativa: Encuesta de Población Activa (EPA) T3 2021. 2 de noviembre de 2021. Observatorio de Igualdad y Empleo de Fundación Mujeres.

proportion of women graduating in higher technical studies (STEM) as an important way to reduce inequality in the labour market⁵.

- **Economy and technology**

- The last crises have reduced the income of certain social groups, increasing inequality, social exclusion and poverty

According to the latest FOESSA report⁶, a year and a half after the outbreak of the pandemic, 11 million people are now in a situation of social exclusion in Spain. This reveals a widening of the space of exclusion, where 2.5 million new people now live compared to 2018. Another significant fact is for the first time since 2007, the number of people in severe exclusion exceeds 6 million people, making them one of the main victims of COVID-19, with an increase of almost 2 million people compared to 2018. In view of this reality, VET should be geared towards strengthening the skills of people at risk of social exclusion with a view to improving their chances of labour insertion.

- Accelerated process of technological change

The latest Annual Training Needs Assessment Report⁷ identifies an acceleration of the digital transformation and robotics, partly accelerated by the effect of the pandemic. Both processes will have a profound impact on employment and society, together with the growing importance of sustainability (green economy). A consequence of this acceleration in technological change is the need for upskilling or reskilling of many workers.

- Risk of digital exclusion

According to data from the Report on Vocational Training in Spain 2021⁸, only 40% of the population has advanced digital skills, a percentage that is even lower after the age of 45. Age is a brake on reaching advanced levels of digital skills, as it is only present in 48% of people aged 35-44, 36.7% of people aged 45-54 and 22.2% of those aged 55-64. In addition to age, inequality and the gap in access to connectivity and devices is related to family and socio-economic background, generating a risk of a digital divide. Similarly, the territorial factor, such as living in rural environments, also implies a difficulty in accessing connectivity and a disadvantage compared to people living in urban environments. Taking these aspects into account, VET must take this risk into account in terms of supply, but also in terms of facilitating access to devices. Another important aspect will be to align with other strategies, such as the fight against depopulation.

⁵ Caprile, M.; Palmén, R.; Sanz de Miguel, P.; Dente, G. (2015.). *Encouraging STEM studies. Labour Market Situation and Comparison of Practices Targeted at Young People in Different Member States*. European Parliament. DIRECTORATE GENERAL FOR INTERNAL POLICIES POLICY DEPARTMENT A: ECONOMIC AND SCIENTIFIC POLICY.

⁶ FOESSA (2021): Análisis y Perspectivas 2021. Sociedad expulsada y derecho a ingresos. Fundación Fomento de Estudios Sociales y de Sociología Aplicada.

⁷ Ministerio del Trabajo (2021): Informe Anual de prospección y detección de necesidades formativas 2021. Observatorio de las Ocupaciones.

⁸ Gamboa, J. y Moso, M (dir) (2021): Informe 2021: La FP como clave de desarrollo y sostenibilidad. Observatorio sobre la FP en España Caixa Bank dualiza.

- **Labour market and employment**
 - After the crisis triggered by the pandemic, employment has been growing, reaching values similar to the pre-crisis period

According to the latest Quarterly Labour Market Analysis Report⁹, in the second quarter of 2021 there was a growth in employment and in the labour force. Thus, during the last year, 1,064,500 jobs were created and 1,240,300 people joined the labour force. This figure contrasts with the one recorded a year earlier, in the second quarter of 2020 (at the height of the pandemic), when 1,197,700 jobs were lost and 1,060,300 people left the labour force. More recent data, for the month of October, show that Social Security enrolment increased on average by almost 159,478 people, the highest figure for this month in the series (since 2002), to a total number of workers of 19,690,590 workers. Therefore, the annual rate of employment growth thus stands at 3.7% and in almost all Spanish provinces there is already more employment than before the pandemic.
 - Fragmentation of employment

Standard employment (employment with a permanent contract, full-time, etc.) is still the most widespread. However, non-standard or atypical forms of employment have proliferated in recent decades (temporary, part-time, economically dependent self-employed, non-labour scholarships, etc.), as well as new forms of employment emerging as a result of digitalisation (digital platforms, remote work, etc.)¹⁰. Some of the problems linked to the lack of quality in the working conditions of these forms of employment can be addressed in the framework of the regulation of vocational training (training contract, etc.).
 - The demand for technical profiles is increasing

According to data from the Report on VET in Spain 2021¹¹, job offers for professional profiles in IVET training cycles have gone from representing 38.8% of the total in 2019 to 41.3% in 2020. Therefore, companies increasingly value and need people trained in VET cycles and an adequate offer will have to be prepared to respond to this increased demand.
- **Education and training**
 - Evolution of the legal framework of VET

Over the last decade, there has been significant regulatory development at the national level (Royal Decree 1529/2012 and the LOMLOE, VET Law, currently being processed) and at the regional level (for example, Law 4/2018 on VET in the Basque Country and Law 10/2015 on VET and professional qualifications in Catalonia). In general terms, a fragmentation of the regulatory framework for dual VET at regional level can be observed, although the VET law currently being processed may provide it with greater integration and consistency.

⁹ Ministerio del Trabajo (2021): Informe Trimestral de Análisis del Mercado de Trabajo nº138. Septiembre de 2021. Available at: https://www.mites.gob.es/ficheros/ministerio/sec_trabajo/analisis_mercado_trabajo/numeros/138/138.pdf

¹⁰ Eurofound (2015). New forms of employment. Publications Office of the European Union.

¹¹ Gamboa, J. y Moso, M (dir) (2021): Informe 2021: La FP como clave de desarrollo y sostenibilidad. Observatorio sobre la FP en España Caixa Bank dualiza.

- Insufficient integration of the VET system and different outcomes
 IVET is located within the education system and depends on the Ministry of Education while VET for employment has its own regulations and depends on the Ministry of Labour. IVET has increased the number of enrolments. On the other hand, there has been a reduction in the number of companies participating in VET for employment, as shown in the 2019 Annual Report on In-Company Training¹². This trend has coincided with a limitation of the role of social partners in this field.

- VET is becoming increasingly attractive to society
 VET has become a prestigious and attractive training pathway for young people. According to data from the Report on VET in Spain 2021, in the last academic year, total enrolments in VET grew by 6.5%. This means that since the 2015-2016 academic year, the accumulated growth is 18.6%, reaching almost 900,000 students.

- Mismatch between what people want to study and the professional profiles demanded by companies
 In the last school year, there were several Autonomous Communities (for example, Madrid and Catalonia) where thousands of young people were unable to enrol in VET. But at the same time, a part of the VET offer remains unfilled, especially in some families that have good employability prospects, and then there are complaints from companies that cannot find qualified personnel, especially in the industrial sector. This generates a debate that should be resolved in the strategic planning of VET: whether to respond to the preferences of individuals or the needs of companies¹³.

- **Industrial relations**
 - Important tradition of social dialogue in the field of VET
 VET has historically been one of the areas in which social dialogue has been most successful. In the years following the economic crisis of 2008, however, there was a trend towards unilateral government intervention in this area. Dual VET was implemented without social dialogue. This trend has been reversed following the establishment of social dialogue roundtables and processes in which the social partners have addressed, among other aspects, the new VET law, which is currently before Parliament.

¹² FUNDAE (2021): Informe anual 2019 de Formación en las Empresas. Available at: https://www.fundae.es/docs/default-source/default-document-library/formacion-empresas-2019_web.pdf

¹³ Merino, R. (2021): El creixement de la demanda d'FP: claus per entendre'n les causes i conseqüències. Artículo de opinión publicado el 15 de noviembre de 2021 en el Diari de la FP. Available at: <https://diarifp.cat/2021/11/15/rafael-merino-creixement-demanda-fp-claus-entendre-causes-consequencies/>

3. Drivers in the VET field

This section identifies potential drivers that may affect the future of dual VET and should therefore be taken into account in the design of scenarios on governance structures. The drivers of change are based on the four dimensions suggested by Cedefop in its VET Scenarios Toolkit¹⁴:

- **Economy and employment**

- *Employment creation*

The OECD's growth forecast for Spain is that the unemployment rate will rise to 15% by 2021, 14.2% by 2022 and 13.6% by 2023. Estimates made by Cedefop¹⁵ indicate that it will increase by 1.3 million employed people in 2030 compared to 2020 (an increase of 7%) and will generate a total of 9.6 million job opportunities up to 2030.

- *Increased demand for technical profiles (VET)*

Cedefop's forecasts¹⁶ indicate that in Spain there will be a particularly notable growth in intermediate and high-skilled employment, while low-skilled employment will decrease. Specifically, Cedefop indicates that by 2030 there will be an increase of 1.8% in medium-skilled employment and 2.1% in high-skilled employment. This is leading to an increase in the level of qualification of the low-educated population, which will have to be intensified in the coming years. If this qualification does not take place, the shortage of certain professionals could worsen.

- *Emergence of new skill and qualification demands*

As the National Digital Skills Pla¹⁷ indicates, the green transition is an increasingly important driver of labour demand and the supply of digital skills in all sectors. The positive effects of the transition to a greener and more resilient economy can therefore be maximised by simultaneously developing the 'green' skills, knowledge and competences required for resource-efficient processes and technologies, and integrating them into businesses and communities. A transformation where COVID-19 is acting as a catalyst for a necessary change that provides an opportunity to make profound changes in the labour market now, hand in hand with transformations in the training system.

- **Technological change**

- *Increasing digital skills*

The Digital Agenda 2025 establishes digital skills among its 10 priority axes, with the aim of strengthening the digital skills of workers and citizens as a whole and pursuing the goal of achieving 80% of the Spanish population having basic digital skills by the end of its programming period. It is worth highlighting two data, the first one that according to Cedefop the percentage of jobs requiring at least

¹⁴ Leney, T., Coles, M., Grollman, P. & Vilu, R. (2004): Manual de Escenarios. Cedefop dossier series: 9

¹⁵ Skills Forecast. Available at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/tools/skills-forecast>

¹⁶ Skills Forecast. Available at: <https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/tools/skills-forecast>

¹⁷ Ministerio de Asuntos Económicos y Transformación Digital (2021): Plan Nacional de Competencias Digitales. Available at: https://portal.mineco.gob.es/RecursosArticulo/mineco/ministerio/ficheros/210127_plan_nacional_de_competencias_digitales.pdf

basic digital skills in the EU is 85% and the second one that, in 2020, 60.2% of the Spanish population aged 16-74 had at least basic digital skills.

- *Digitalisation of VET*

The VET of the future requires an improvement in the digital skills of teachers, students and education administration workers; the provision of adequate resources and means for centres; and a change in teaching methodologies. It should be noted that this is indicated as a challenge in the report Challenges for the Future of VET¹⁸. Furthermore, it is necessary to work against the existing risk of digital exclusion and to ensure a fair and equitable digital transition. This will ensure that no one is left behind in their inclusion in the digital world, as established in the National Plan for Digital Competences.

- **Society**

- *Improving career guidance for young people*

The report Challenges for the future of VET¹⁹ analyses and defines 12 recommendations to help promote VET in our country. Among these, they indicate the need to focus on school guidance processes that go beyond informative strategies and focus on career development, where student participation, research and involvement is a fundamental part of the process, and where VET is positioned at the same level as any other option. The Draft Law also places emphasis on vocational guidance. Thus, an improvement in this area is expected, making future job opportunities more transparent, which could help to increase the number of students in vocational training, overcome the existing deficit of technical profiles and ensure that the training system provides a better response to the shortage of certain professionals.

- *Increase in the number of students studying dual VET.*

According to data from the Report on VET in Spain 2021²⁰, the number of students studying Dual VET has grown by 61.7% in the last four academic years (up to a total of 32,000 students in the 2019-2020 academic year), and an increase of 25% in the last year. However, they represent only 3.7% of the total number of VET students. A percentage far from the European average. Social partners and public administrations agree that the low percentage of students in dual vocational training is a symptom that the current model of VET in Spain is not working and must be modified in order to increase this percentage in the coming years and bring it closer to the European average.

- **Government policy and industrial relations**

- *Greater integration of the two VET systems*

The necessary integration of IVET and VET for employment is an element on which there is broad consensus and which the social partners indicate in the documents drawn up on VET and dual VET. However, the way in which this integration is carried out or achieved may be different, as can be seen in some

¹⁸ COTEC (2021). Los desafíos para el futuro de la FP. Fundación COTEC, Fundación Telefónica y Dualiza CaixaBank. Available at: <https://cotec.es/proyecto/los-desafios-para-el-futuro-de-la-fp-en-espaa/3726db23-a539-684f-461f-144c6c0e16d1>

¹⁹ COTEC (2021). Los desafíos para el futuro de la FP. Fundación COTEC, Fundación Telefónica y Dualiza CaixaBank. Available at: <https://cotec.es/proyecto/los-desafios-para-el-futuro-de-la-fp-en-espaa/3726db23-a539-684f-461f-144c6c0e16d1>

²⁰ Gamboa, J. y Moso, M (dir) (2021): Informe 2021: La FP como clave de desarrollo y sostenibilidad. Observatorio sobre la FP en España Caixa Bank dualiza.

regional regulations. A substantial increase in the integration of IVET and VET for Employment is expected with the new VET law.

- *Greater legal consistency for the regional dual VET models*
 In their documents, the social partners state the need to generate a more integrated and consistent regulatory framework that allows for the homogenisation of certain aspects of the different autonomous models of dual VET that currently exist. This integration could be compatible with the decentralised structure of regional competences in the field of education. The VET secretariat is also in agreement on this aspect, which the new VET law seeks to advance.
- *The Draft Law on VET and the regulations that will help to develop it*
 The draft law that is in the process of being approved is an element of improvement of the VET system that seeks a better integration of the two VET sub-systems. Once approved, its development will require regulations and the adoption of new instruments that should introduce improvements, but which have yet to be developed (e.g., in relation to the training contract).
- *Progressive consensus on dual VET and increased participation of the social partners*
 Following the regulation of the dual VET system, several publications found significant divergences among social partners on different areas of dual VET regulation (Sanz de Miguel, 2017; Artiles et al., 2019; Barrientos et al., 2019). However, the fieldwork of the INVOLVE project reveals the progressive emergence of consensus on different dimensions, which may favour the further development of collective regulation mechanisms (social dialogue and collective bargaining) and strengthen the quality of dual VET implementation.

4. Scenario proposal

On the basis of the trends presented and taking into account the impact of the drivers indicated above, which would broadly reinforce the political importance of the dual VET system, two scenarios are defined below and will be finalised following the exchange of ideas and the debate scheduled for 15 December. The proposal for governance structures is developed on the basis of the three levels of governance analysed by the INVOLVE project:

- i. The political-strategic level, where stakeholders make decisions on the medium and long-term evolution of the system that needs political legitimisation.
- ii. The technical-strategic level, which also deals with the long-term evolution of the system, but additionally involves technical specialists, as decisions are based on expert knowledge.
- iii. The technical-operational level, which focuses on the effective implementation of policies on the ground.

Scenario 1. Increased participation and continuity of the institutional framework

The first scenario continues with the institutional framework of the current VET system, introducing a series of improvements aimed at increasing the participation of the social partners.

At the *political-strategic* level, greater importance will be given to the recently created social dialogue table, as a space for negotiating and jointly agreeing on changes and adaptations to the regulation of dual VET. At this level, the participation of the social partners in the General Council for Vocational Training (CGFP) could also be improved by setting up a specific body, commission or working group, which would be a co-decision body. This would enable the Council to become a political-strategic body, in which the medium and long-term strategy and objectives of dual VET are discussed and agreed upon.

At the *technical-strategic* level, sectoral collective bargaining will be afforded greater significance. It will be the instrument of governance that will make it possible to promote dual VET at the sectoral level and adapt legislation to the specificities of each economic activity. It will also make progress in defining the policy powers of employers' organisations (for example, specifying the processes to support companies through external tutors or mentos) and of workers' representative bodies (for example, information and consultation rights) that can improve the quality of dual VET.

At this level, the participation of social partners in the National Institute of Qualification (INCUAL) will be improved, especially in the technical processes aimed at identifying and updating vocational qualifications. In this case, improvements are proposed to make it easier for social partners to compare the qualifications identified by INCUAL. On the one hand, the task of identifying experts will fall exclusively on the social partners. On the other hand, it is proposed that the social partners will be provided with greater technical and economic resources to facilitate and improve their participation in this process. Part of these resources should also be earmarked to encourage the participation of the social partners in the sectoral observatories, allowing them to contribute to skill forecasting tasks.

At the *technical-operational* level, business organisations will help to support the participation of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) by providing mentors or tutors at the sectoral level who can carry out the mentoring of apprentices in more than one company. With regard to work councils, trade unions emphasise, on the one hand, the difficulties faced in exercising information

and consultation rights. This is because a large part of the dual VET is developed through an internship and not a contract – if it were a contract, the company would be obliged to provide this information, but in the case of the grant it is not obliged to do so. The promotion of labour contracts for apprentices could partially reverse these difficulties. On the other hand, training centres could establish mechanisms for dialogue with workers' union representative bodies. As both training centres and workers' representative bodies have a role in monitoring and controlling the quality of work placements, and have unique and non-replaceable resources and expertise, cooperation between the two could improve their work.

Scenario 2. New governance structures for the VET system

The second scenario involves reforming the structure of the current VET system. This scenario is inspired by the governance model recently implemented in Catalonia.

The main feature of this scenario would be the creation of a Spanish Agency for VET and Professional Qualifications, which would have both political-strategic and technical-strategic functions. The Agency would report directly to the Office of the President and would have a Commission, in the form of a tripartite body with the participation of the Ministries of Employment and Education and the social partners. The distribution of votes would have to be negotiated. This body would be responsible for the strategic planning of VET at the national level, and for the control and monitoring of tasks carried out by the Agency, operating at the *political-strategic* level.

At the *technical-strategic* level, the agency would integrate INCUAL, and introduce improvements in this body in order to be more operational and efficient, and to strengthen the role of the social partners. The Agency, as a technical body, will also be responsible for better monitoring and evaluation of the courses, providing more up-to-date and accurate information to the social partners and other stakeholders in VET.

At the *technical-operational* level, similar proposals to the first scenario would be followed in relation to the promotion of SME participation thanks to the development of the figure of the 'joint' tutor, encouraging workers' representative bodies to work alongside training centres and companies in the training process. A new aspect could be the promotion of local VET Councils with the participation of the actors interested in the area of VET in the local area. The local VET Councils could plan, organise and implement a comprehensive training offer adapted to their territory.

5. Critical issues discussed

In the first round of interventions, participants commented on trends and drivers of change. They also commented on several critical aspects that need to be taken into account when devising scenarios and establishing strategies for the greater involvement of social partners. These critical aspects can be grouped according to whether they refer to the governance structure of dual VET or to the dual VET model in Spain.

Regarding the governance structure of dual VET, comments were made on several key aspects:

- A fundamental aspect is the willingness on the part of the government to actively involve the social partners. The format of this participation – whether it be through a Dialogue Table, a General Council, a Commission, an Agency, or another means – is of little importance. What is important is that there is a will to really take into account the social partners as active interlocutors who participate in decision-making and not as passive subjects who are informed of the decisions that are going to be taken.
- The structure of governance, whether it is centralised or decentralised, is irrelevant providing it works.
- The role of the social partners must be institutionalised, avoiding the politicisation of social dialogue and its volatility in the face of changes in government.
- Governance should be executive and strategic, not consultative and/or informative. This means that the role of the social partners should become more important in decision-making.
- Governance should take the form of a tripartite and parity body.
- Funding for the governance of the system should be envisaged – specifically, funding that facilitates and recognises the role of the social partners in this governance structure.
- The success of governance systems is conditioned by structural factors (for example, labour market dynamism and productive specialisation) and the capacities of the social partners (both organisational and technical).
- It is more effective to work on organising existing governance structures and equipping them sufficiently (technically and financially) than to create new structures.

Concerning the dual VET model, the following aspects were discussed:

- The integration of the dual VET model at the state level is key. Integration of the Employment and Education models should be carried out in order to avoid duplication.
- Started recently, three new legislations are being developed that have an impact on dual VET: the new VET law, the Royal Decree on Universities and the labour reform. The result of these new regulations will determine changes in the Spanish dual VET model.
- There is a lack of governmental strategic vision on what dual VET is. There is a need to work on long-term state strategies and 'visions' for dual VET. This vision should be agreed upon with the social partners and transmitted to the Ministries of Education and Labour so that it can be implemented on the basis of the instruments that each has at a technical level.
- It is necessary to have a Spanish dual VET model that integrates and harmonises the 17 autonomous models that currently exist, respecting the competences of the Autonomous Communities.

6. Commented areas for improvement

In the second round of interventions, the participants discussed a series of comments assessing the two scenarios and indicating possible improvements, which are included in the following section. The assessments of both scenarios are summarised in the following table.

Table 1. Positive and negative aspects of each scenario as rated by participants

	Advantages	Disadvantages
Scenario 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - More enabling in the current context - Aligned with the new VET Law - Social dialogue plays a leading role - Importance of collective bargaining in the regional and sectoral adaptation of regulations - Reform of the CGFP - Ordering of existing structures 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Low-cost governance - Does not overcome the Education–Employment dichotomy - Integration of IVET and VET for employment is limited - Without appropriate resources, inequalities will occur between private and public schools in relation to coordination with companies
Scenario 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Executive and strategic governance - Tripartite and parity body - Overcoming the Education–Employment dichotomy through the integration of IVET and VET for employment - Better monitoring and evaluation of the model - More and better foresight (Single Observatory) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The creation of a new body and the cost (time and resources) involved in setting it up. - The creation of new structures in addition to the existing ones, ultimately with the same actors - The integration of existing structures

Going into more detail on the evaluation of the scenarios, Scenario 1 is considered to be achievable. In the current context, with a new VET law in the process of approval, the social partners consider that this scenario is in line with what the law proposes. Thus, the proposed scenario could be implemented through the forthcoming regulations that will form the law. The social partners also consider it interesting to give a greater role to the recently created Social Dialogue Round Table. As was seen in the fieldwork report, there are disparate opinions among employer organisations and trade unions about its functionality and their assessment of it. Therefore, the social partners are in favour of giving it a greater role as a space for negotiation. Another positive aspect of the Scenario 1 is that sectoral collective bargaining can become an instrument for promoting dual VET at the sectoral level and adapting legislation to the specificities of each economic activity. Even from a territorial point of view, this is helpful for those economic activities that are concentrated in a single region. In this way, they consider it interesting to place greater significance on sectoral collective bargaining. Lastly, the social partners are calling for the existing structures to be better organised, which is why they also value this aspect of the scenario positively. The social partners are demanding simplification and better coordination between the existing structures, since, to a large extent, the same people are always involved in many of the existing bodies. This reorganisation of the system's structures and instruments must begin with the reform of the CGFP, making it more operational.

At the same time, the social partners negatively assess that the scenario is somewhat of a continuation of the current governance structure. In this sense, they indicate four aspects that are a continuation and that they would like to improve: their role in the system, the Employment–Education dichotomy, the integration of IVET and vocational training for employment, and the lack of resources. Regarding an aspect for improvement, the social partners point out that the role they play is merely maintained at the same level, but they would like to play a more important role. Although they value that the scenario implies greater participation in the system, they indicate that their role would continue to be of a consultative nature. The employers' association describes it as 'low cost' governance. What the social partners want is to participate in decision-making on an equal footing with the government, which this scenario does not incorporate. They also consider that this scenario does not address or provide a plan to overcome the current Employment–Education dichotomy, and they consider the continuation of this to be negative.

Related to this aspect, they consider that with this scenario the integration of IVET and vocational training for employment systems is limited. Without overcoming the dichotomy between the two Ministries, it will not be possible to achieve full integration of the two subsystems. Financing is the last aspect that the social partners consider to be a negative continuation of the current situation. According to the trade unions, the scenario still does not provide appropriate resources to all public centres. This generates inequalities with respect to private schools, which have greater resources. These resources can be used for greater and better dialogue with companies and afford greater opportunities to develop dual VET courses. In addition, at the territorial level, there are also inequalities between public centres, since some have more resources than others or resources that help them to develop dual vocational training, such as freeing up teaching hours to search for companies with which to collaborate.

With regard to Scenario 2, the social partners rate it as desirable. Thus, they value positively the creation of the Agency and its dependence on the Presidency. The Commission would be created within the Agency as a tripartite and parity body, changing its role from consultative to part of the decision-making process, and therefore giving it equal footing and satisfying this demand. Furthermore, it is a body in charge of the strategic planning of VET (strategic) and the monitoring of the Agency's activity (executive). Thus, the social partners will participate at the strategic and executive levels. In this way, the executive and strategic governance they demand is achieved. The fact that the Agency depends on the Presidency, not on Employment or Education, is an aspect that the social partners consider very positive since it means integration of the system from the top-down, ideally ensuring integration takes place all the way down to the departments of the two Ministries. With this new organisational the social partners believe it is likely that the dichotomy between Employment–Education will be overcome since there will be some body above the latter who sees the global vision of VET and applies it to the lower levels. They also value this as a positive step towards achieving the real or effective integration of both VET systems. The role of the Agency as a technical instrument in charge of monitoring and evaluating the VET system through systematic data collection and analysis is another aspect. This is considered by the social partners as a substantial improvement over the current situation, in which there is very poor monitoring and evaluation. Likewise, they consider it an improvement that this technical instrument also centralises the forecasting.

As a criticism aspect, the social partners point out the time and economic cost of creating a new Agency. Its creation implies a cost in terms of the time required for its implementation, due to the drafting of the regulations for its creation, the regulations for its development, and the appointment of technical and/or contracting staff. The creation also implies an economic cost, as this new structure must be financed. Thus, making it operational comes with a significant inherent cost in terms of resources and the creation of a new structure in addition to the existing ones in which the social partners are already participating. It is noted that there is a danger that this will become one more structure to be added to the existing ones – without any value added. To avoid it becoming an add-on, the existing technical structures and instruments should be integrated under the structure of the Agency. However, this integration may also be a critical aspect as it will entail a change of functions, the disappearance of some structures or the loss of functions of some existing bodies. This will also mean reforming the regulations governing these structures and technical instruments.

7. Final scenario proposal

Scenario 1. Increased participation and continuity of the institutional framework

The first scenario continues with the institutional framework of the current VET system, introducing a series of improvements aimed at increasing the participation of social partners. During the scenario workshop, it was referred to by the social partners as the "possibilist"

scenario. This scenario combines aspects seen in the governance models of the Basque Country and Catalonia.

At the *political-strategic* level, the first element of governance would be the VET Social Dialogue Table. The recently created Table would be the space where the Government and social partners could jointly negotiate and agree on policies related to VET, and the changes and adaptations of dual VET. Thus, following the model seen in the Basque Country, the aim would be to give greater importance to the Dialogue Table. The second element of governance at this level would be the General Council for Vocational Training (CGFP). This should be reformed by creating a tripartite body in charge of designing the strategic lines, the distribution of funds and establishing the milestones of VET (including dual VET) in Spain. One option would be to reform the composition and functions of the Permanent Commission, following the model seen in Catalonia.

At the *technical-strategic* level, sectoral collective bargaining will become more significant. It will be the governance instrument that will make it possible to promote dual VET at the sectoral level and adapt legislation to the specificities of each economic activity. It will also make progress in defining the competences of employers' organisations (for example, tutor of 'equal body') and of workers' unitary representative bodies (for example, information and consultation rights) that can improve the quality of dual VET.

At this level, the participation of social partners in INCUAL will be improved, particularly in the technical processes aimed at identifying and updating professional qualifications. In this case, improvements are proposed to make it easier for social partners to contrast the qualifications identified by INCUAL. On the one hand, the task of identifying experts will fall exclusively to the social partners. On the other hand, it is proposed to provide the social partners with greater technical and economic resources to facilitate, improve and professionalise their participation in this process. INCUAL's forecasting methodology should also be improved, starting with the establishment of a stable forecasting methodology consisting of the permanent observation of a series of companies. These companies would have to meet a series of requirements, for example, being respectful of labour conditions, sustainability and leading in their sector.

Finally, it is proposed to improve coordination between existing resources and technical instruments. An improvement would come from establishing coordination and communication protocols between them and simplifying their number, avoiding existing overlaps and/or duplications.

At the *technical-operational* level, employer organisations will contribute to supporting the participation of SMEs, providing 'joint' tutors at the sectoral level who can carry out the functions of tutoring apprentices in more than one company. With regard to the workers' representative bodies, they should have a greater role in the monitoring of internships in companies and the apprentices' Activity Plan. The promotion of hiring would help to increase this protagonism. Here it will be necessary to create a flexible training contract that can be adapted to the different types of training and the different situations in the various sectors of activity. On the other hand, it is proposed to improve the resourcing of public training centres, with the aim of establishing mechanisms for dialogue with the workers' unitary representation bodies in order to be able to carry out this follow-up.

Scenario 2. New governance structures for the VET system

The second scenario involves reforming the structure of the current VET system. This scenario is inspired by the governance model recently implemented in Catalonia. During the scenario workshop, it was named by the social partners as the 'desirable' scenario.

The main feature of this scenario would be the creation of a Spanish Agency for Vocational Training and Qualifications, which would have political-strategic and technical-strategic

functions. The Agency would report directly to the Presidency and would have a Commission, as a tripartite management body, with the participation of the Ministries of Employment and Education, and the social partners. The distribution of votes would have to be negotiated, but ideally, there would be parity. This body would operate at the *political-strategic* level. Thus, this body would be in charge of the political and strategic planning of VET at the state level. In addition, it would also carry out the control and monitoring of the tasks performed by the Agency. Within the Agency, a dual VET working group or commission would be created to define the strategic lines and establish milestones for the Spanish dual VET model. The CGFP would be integrated within the Agency as a body for the participation of the agents involved in VET, particularly at the territorial level. The Agency model could be replicated in each Autonomous Community, as has happened with the VET Councils.

At the *technical-strategic* level, the Agency would integrate all the technical instruments that help decision-making at the political-strategic level (INCUAL, Observatories, Sectoral Parity Structures, National Reference Centres), simplifying them, eliminating duplication or overlap, and improving their coordination. In this way, it would be possible to be more efficient with economic resources. In relation to forecasting, it is proposed that improvements be made by merging the technical instruments to provide forecasting under a single Observatory. The function of the Observatory would be the collection and analysis of data on VET (including dual VET) to provide information for the design of policies, through the monitoring and evaluation of the Spanish VET system. The Observatory would have regional and local offices to analyse VET (. Improvements would be introduced in INCUAL to make it more operative and efficient, and to strengthen the role of social partners. It would be proposed to establish a stable qualification forecasting methodology, based on the observation of companies – those with respectful labour conditions, pursuing sustainability, and leading in their field – combined with the opinion of experts and social partners.

At the *technical-operational* level, proposals similar to the Scenario 1 would be followed with regard to encouraging the participation of SMEs by developing the figure of the 'joint' tutor. This would encourage the workers' representative bodies to have more involvement in the training process by means of a greater role in the follow-up of the training. This would include a greater role for both training centres and companies in the monitoring of both internships in companies and the apprentices' Activity Plan; the provision of resources for public centres with the aim of improving dialogue with companies and workers' representative bodies; and the creation of a flexible training contract that can be adapted to the different types of training and different situations in the various sectors of activity. A novel aspect, with respect to Scenario 1, could be to promote the role of the Social Councils of the Integrated Centres and the existing local/regional VET Councils to plan a VET offer appropriate to the territory, organising the existing resources and promoting dual VET. These Councils usually involve social partners and stakeholders in the area of VET in the territory with the intention of being able to plan, organise and implement a comprehensive training offer adapted to their territory.